

**MINUTES
SPECIAL BUSINESS MEETING
NEW CASTLE COUNTY HISTORIC REVIEW BOARD
DEPARTMENT OF LAND USE - NEW CASTLE ROOM
87 READS WAY, NEW CASTLE, DELAWARE
December 17, 2019
5:00 P.M.**

The Business Meeting of the Historic Review Board of New Castle County was held on Tuesday, December 17, 2019 in the New Castle room of the Government Center Building, 87 Reads Way, Corporate Commons in New Castle, DE.

The meeting was called to order by Dr. Benson at [7:01 p.m.]

The following Board members were present:

Dr. Barbara Benson
John Davis
John Brook
Karen Anderson
Barbara Silber
Perry Patel

The following Board members were absent:

Steve Johns
Rafael Zahralddin

Historic Review Board, Department of Law

Colleen Norris

The following Department of Land Use employees were present at the meeting:

Elizabeth Hatch
Christopher Jackson
Stacey Dahlstrom

The following members of the Public were present:

Wendie Stabler
Betty Lindberg

RULES OF PROCEDURE

Ms. Hatch read the rules of procedure into the record.

MINUTES

November 5, 2019 Business Meeting Minutes

On a motion made by Ms. Silber and seconded by Mr. Patel, the Historic Review Board voted to approve (Abstentions: Brook, Davis) the November 5, 2019 Business Meeting Minutes.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

App. 2019-15645: 274 E Chestnut Hill Road. (Northeast side of E Chestnut Hill Road, at the northeast corner of the intersection of E Chestnut Hill Road and S Chapel Street.) (TP 11-006.10-076). Commercial tenant fit-out permit to perform repairs on the Everett Johnson House including roof repairs, replacement fenestration, and repairs to an existing porch roof. Constructed ca. 1800. CN & H Zoning. CD 5.

On a motion made by Mr. Patel and seconded by Mr. Brook, the Historic Review Board voted unanimously to **APPROVE** the permit with the following conditions:

- The Historic Review Board recommended that the applicant explore composite cedar shake roofing.
- The Historic Review Board stated that the vinyl-clad replacement, carriage-style doors shall be of a double-leaf, wood-carriage door style.
- The Historic Review Board recommended that colors utilized for the siding matches the existing siding and recommended that cedar impression, single, 9” staggered certainteed siding be installed.
- The Historic Review Board recommended that mid-range quality, vinyl replacement windows are considered.

Discussion preceding the vote included the following:

Ms. Anderson stated that she believed that the roofing be an architectural asphalt shingle of a higher quality, or an alternative would be a composite shake. The garage door should be of a carriage-house style, and that the garage elevation should be provided to the Board in order for the Board to understand what the intent was. She recommended that the replacement windows also be of a higher quality, as well as the consideration of a fiberglass door rather than aluminum.

Ms. Silber stated that she understands there is a need for durable, weatherproof materials that are low maintenance. She stated that while using these materials, what is being replaced should be considered in regards to historic context. She noted if the applicant is already going through the trouble of repairing building materials that were already replacements, perhaps consideration should be given to replacing “replacement materials” with historically appropriate materials (e.g. replacing the asphalt shingle roof with asphalt shingles rather than cedar shakes). Dr. Benson inquired if there are historic pictures of the dwelling to show what the historic roof was comprised of. Ms. Hatch indicated that there is a photograph from the early twentieth century dating to the structure’s period of significance and that the roof appears to be cedar shake. Ms. Silber stated that perhaps the Board should consider the aesthetic qualities of the proposed materials.

Mr. Brook stated that he had a different take from what had been expressed. He stated that the Board should recognize that the structure has been modified throughout the years and that it has been determined not eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places. He stated that he did believe taking it back to its presumed original appearance was worthy of examination. He stated that he was certain that the windows in the structure were not original to the structure and that he wondered if it was worth requiring the property owner to spend extra money to use historic materials when they are proposing to utilize modern materials that last longer yet have the same

look. He stated he believed that the carriage doors were likely later additions to the structure. Ms. Anderson stated that she was recommending that they match and that she was in agreement with him in regards to his statement on the windows. She stated having higher quality windows will have the same look and will have the illusion of true divided lights.

Ms. Hatch read aloud the proposed scope of work to the Board in order to confirm the Historic Review Board's decision for the proposed permit. The Historic Review Board offered the following comments on the scope of work:

- The Historic Review Board recommended that the applicant explore composite cedar shake roofing.
- The Historic Review Board stated that the vinyl-clad replacement, carriage-style doors shall be of a double-leaf, wood-carriage door style.
- The Historic Review Board recommended that colors utilized for the siding matches the existing siding and recommended that cedar impression, single, 9" staggered certainteed siding be installed.
- The Historic Review Board recommended that mid-range quality, vinyl replacement windows are considered.

Ms. Stabler was approved to approach the Historic Review Board and stated that the applicant will consider the use of the alternative items as proposed by the Historic Review Board. Dr. Benson stated that the applicant will be provided with a list of items approved by the Historic Review Board.

App. 2019-11543: 1139 La Grange Parkway. (East side of La Grange Parkway, east of the intersection with S Aikens Tavern Court.) (TP 11-026.20-001). Residential building permit to construct a screened-in porch off the rear of a dwelling located within the La Grange subdivision. S & H Zoning. CD 11.

On a motion made by Mr. Brook and seconded by Ms. Anderson, the Historic Review Board voted unanimously to DENY Application 2019-11543. Discussion preceding the vote included the following:

Dr. Benson stated that she had worked on the design standards when the development was initially approved, and that the Board worked very hard to ensure that the design of the front facades were appropriate; however, she did not recall anyone being concerned with the rear facades. She stated that the Board should consider whether too high of a standard is being set for the design guidelines.

Mr. Brook stated that his primary objection to the addition was with the windows, and lack of mullions, as they are not in keeping with the back of the properties. He stated he wasn't sure if the property owner could achieve appropriate windows with the existing contractor; however, appropriate windows are available to the owner. He stated that he believed the proposed windows are out of character with the surrounding area to an extent that the permit should be denied. Ms. Anderson added that all the windows on the rear of the structure also include mullions. Dr. Benson acknowledged this; however, stated that it may be difficult to install a sunroom that will include mullion windows. She stated that the Historic Review Board should work with the property owner in order to come up with a design that would be more appropriate for the surrounding area. Mr. Patel stated that if the property owner is making an investment in the home, then perhaps working with another vendor would help him achieve an appropriate style that meets the needs for the community.

Ms. Silber stated that there may be a compromise, such as putting in mullions in the windows; however there should be flexibility in what is added on to dwellings in the neighborhood. Mr. Brook

stated that the Board should refer the owner to the existing standards in the neighborhood to help with design.

REPORT OF THE PRESERVATION PLANNER

Ms. Hatch stated she provided the Historic Review Board with the recently adopted Ordinance 19-080, which had come before the Historic Review Board in previous months. She outlined the ordinance and Council amendment, which stated that the Historic Review Board must come to a decision on a demolition permit within 45 days from the date an application is referred to the Historic Review Board. Ms. Hatch stated the intention the amendment was to ensure that an applicant had predictability in regards to timelines for the historic review process. She stated that the Department is exploring an update for the ordinance, as the 45-day timeframe exceed public noticing requirements and the two Historic Review Board public meetings for demolition applications. She stated the original intent of the ordinance was to ensure that the public is involved for the whole nine-month hold period for a demo permit.

Ms. Hatch stated that Department of Land Use Staff was contacted regarding the demolition of the historic manse at Red Clay Creek Presbyterian Church.

Ms. Hatch stated that she recently met with the new caretakers of Newark Union Church, who are a looking to complete a number of projects on the structure and were hoping to gather help and resources to open up the structure to the public.

Ms. Hatch stated that the tax credit program was recently reinstated through Council and that the Department was working with finance in order to set up an application process. Ms. Dahlstrom stated that the Department may work with Council to explore opening up the tax credit program to properties that have been determined eligible for the National Register and that we would engage them for additional feedback.

REPORT OF THE CHAIRPERSON

None.


COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC


None.

ADJOURNMENT

The Board voted to adjourn the meeting at 7:55 p.m.

ATTEST:


Richard E. Hall, AICP
General Manager
Department of Land Use


Dr. Barbara Benson
Chairperson
Historic Review Board